

330-03-1999

RARE BIRD REPORT

Species: Red-necked Phalarope Date of this Observation: 9-7 + 9-16-99

Date Found: 9-7-99 (1) Last Date Seen: 9-16-99 (2)

Location: Greencastle Reservoir on Reservoir Rd.

Township/City: Antrim Twp., Greencastle County: Franklin

Person Writing this report: Dale L. Gearhart

Address: P.O. Box 155, Shady Grove, Pa 17256

Phone: 717-597-3979

Other Observers: Kenneth Gabler, Carl Garner, Eric Martin and others

Who found the bird first: Dale Gearhart

Other documentation included: (Circle all appropriate items) (Make sure all attached items are fully labeled)

Photograph

Audio Recording

Video Recording

If a Specimen, where is it stored? _____

Description: (Attach additional pages as needed —Please do not write on back of this form)

The birds were actually two different observations. One on 9/7/99 and 2 on 9/16/99 with plumage very similar. The eyes had dark patches through the eye and partway to the back of the neck. The neck front was all white throughout. There was some rust appearance to the side & back of the neck and the remainder of the back grayish-black tints. Beak very pointed. Did the typical spinning in the water.

PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE
210 Welcome Ave. Norwood, PA 19074

12 February 2002

Dale L. Gearhart
P.O. Box 155
Shady Grove, PA 17256

Dear Dale,

Thank you for submitting documentation on the following two species. After careful review, the Committee regrets that it has not accepted these records.

King Rail at Hopewell Township on 13 June 1999: The Committee's opinions were divided, and the balloting went two rounds (which partly explains our delay in informing you of the decision). The final vote was five in favor and two not in favor of accepting the record. The Committee's bylaws require a minimum vote of 6-1 for acceptance.

As a result, the record was placed in Class IV-A: "a record for which there exists a majority of evidence in support of the observer's identification; the record is probably correct, but not beyond reasonable doubt."

The five members approving it had no doubt about the identification, but the other two expressed disappointment that a written report did not accompany the photograph describing all of the plumage in detail including portions that are not visible in the photograph.

The two expressed particular concern that a hybrid King x Clapper Rail or a Clapper Rail of the equally bright Florida subspecies *scottii* were not ruled out conclusively. The latter is indeed quite unlikely in geographical terms, but the dissenters felt that it needed to be eliminated because a Spotted Rail from the tropics was previously found dead in western Pennsylvania.

The Committee's bylaws provide for re-evaluation of a record if new information is received. We will welcome a detailed description including measurements if the specimen is still available, and an explanation of how a hybrid or a *scottii* can be separated conclusively.

Red-necked Phalarope at Greencastle Reservoir September 7-16, 1999: The vote was one in favor of acceptance and six not in favor. Those who voted against acceptance felt that the brief description was not sufficient to eliminate Red Phalarope conclusively.

Of course non-acceptance does not mean that either of these birds was identified incorrectly, but rather that the Committee felt that alternatives had not been ruled out conclusively. We hope that these results will not discourage you from submitting reports on any future rarities.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Paul".

For the Committee:
Paul Hess, Chairman

Record #235-01-1999 (King Rail), 330-03-1999 (Red-necked Phalarope)

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Voting Ballot - Round One

Species: Red-necked Phalarope (Phalaropus lobatus)

Date of Sighting: 7 September 1999 to 16 September 1999

Location: FRANKLIN

County: GREENCASTLE RESERVOIR

Observer(s): Dale Gearhart, Kenneth Gabler, Carl Garner, Eric Martin

Date of Submission: 1999

Submitted by: Dale Gearhart

Written Description: Yes

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: No

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead					X			
D. Couchman					X			
P. Hess					X			
R. Ickes				X				
M. Sharp					X			
B. Reid			X					
P. Rodewald					X			
TOTALS			1	1	5			
DECISION					X			

Comments: 1/6

Signature (Secretary):



Date: 2/26/01